

Doc. No. SSE/15.1/b
Case Ref. 2032278
(replaces SSE/15/b)

Appeal by BAA Ltd and Stansted Airport Ltd following the refusal by
Uttlesford District Council of planning application UTT/0717/06/FUL

Revised Summary Proof of Evidence on behalf of Stop Stansted Expansion

Demand for Surface Access and the Implications

Reg Harman BA, FCILT,
FIHT, FRSA, MRTPI

18 September 2007

Reg Harman
Transport Policy & Practice
reg.harman@ntlworld.com
Tel: 01992 415248

2 Valley Close
HERTFORD
Hertfordshire
SG13 8BD

1 PERSONAL DETAILS

- 1.1 My name is Reg Harman. I appear at the Public Inquiry on behalf of Stop Stansted Expansion ('SSE'), by whom I have been commissioned to review the demand for surface access and its implications.
- 1.2 I hold an honours degree in French Studies from the University of Manchester (1966). I am a Fellow of the Chartered Institute of Logistics and Transport, a Fellow of the Institution of Highways & Transportation, a Fellow of the Royal Society of Arts and a Member of the Royal Town Planning Institute.
- 1.3 I am an independent consultant in transport policy and practice; a chartered town planner; and a visiting fellow at the Centre for Transport & Society, University of the West of England, Bristol. My previous employment included positions with the Chartered Institute of Transport, as Policies Director, 1995-2000; Hertfordshire County Council / SERPLAN; the University of East Anglia; the Sheffield/ Rotherham Transport Study; and British Rail.
- 1.4 My experience has ranged widely, covering strategic and project studies for railways and bus systems; local transport planning; accessibility planning; regional planning; demographic forecasting; comparisons of other European countries' practices. Particular responsibilities have included: managing the surface access studies for SERPLAN's input to the RUCATSE project; acting as expert witness for the Hertfordshire Society on the Baldock Northern Bypass inquiry; acting as expert witness for Hertfordshire County Council at the West Coast Main Line TWA inquiry; managing studies of transport impact and implications for development projects, especially hospitals; advising Medway Council on procurement of the Transport for Medway project and acting as its programme manager.

2 SCOPE OF EVIDENCE

- 2.1 My evidence addresses the analysis and forecasting of demand for surface access and the implications of these. It looks in turn at the BAA forecasts and their context; at the implications for travel by car and public transport; and at some wider issues.

3 THE BAA FORECASTS AND THEIR CONTEXT

- 3.1 The BAA forecasts for future growth in surface access demand focus mostly on the target year of 2014. They incorporate comparisons between scenarios with a throughput of 35mppa (the 'interim' cap offered by BAA) and 25mppa (the current planning limit) but these are not on the same basis. The forecasts are not compared to base year figures. BAA's surface access case rests heavily on the case that expansion to 35mppa would result in a manageable impact on roads and public transport in the catchment areas.
- 3.2 The forecasts are prepared through a complex suite of models, so that relating causes to effects is very difficult. The 2007 Update forecasts are lower for key traffics than the 2006 ones, but they reflect revised models and different planning data and it is not possible to follow the basis for the changes.
- 3.3 Passenger surface access demand at 35mppa is forecast to be 29.17 million, about 30% above 25mppa levels of 22.5 million. However, this assumes a higher transfer rate for air passengers with 35mppa than for 25mppa; 16.7% against 10.2%. If the 25mppa level of transfers were used, the 35mppa passenger surface access demand would be 31.42

million, 40% above 25mppa throughput. (T/N FL1148 tests this but does not provide totals for comparison.¹)

- 3.4 In 2004 40.2% of air passengers travelled by public transport (CAA statistics) [CD/211] and BAA forecasts see this being maintained. But nearly three-fifths of air passengers will still travel by car, as will five in every six employees. Much of this travel will be in the usual commuting peaks, adding to serious existing pressures then. But the increased levels will also add to daytime travel pressures, worsening quality of movement.
- 3.5 BAA forecasts show that the employee ratio to passengers will remain at current levels with 25mppa but be much lower with 35mppa. If the ratios were the same, employee numbers and travel would be one-fifth higher.
- 3.6 For the 35mppa case, BAA sees two-thirds more air passengers from East Anglia compared to 25mppa but only one-fifth more for London. The uncertain basis for these patterns of distribution poses questions on the forecast patterns of surface access demand.
- 3.7 The airport's travel impact falls heavily on the north–south corridor, the M11 motorway and the West Anglia railway line; especially towards London. Draft regional guidance envisages major growth in population and employment for the Stansted/M11 sub-region. London and Cambridge are major employment centres: commuting is already high. Increased quality of travel along the corridor is crucial for sustainable advanced economic development.

4 BAA FORECASTS FOR ROAD TRAFFIC AND PUBLIC TRANSPORT

- 4.1 The forecast road traffic flows for 2014 and 2023 are significantly higher than for the base year; around one and a half to two times higher at peak periods. But airport traffic reaches its target level in 2014 and remains static; further growth is of general traffic, reflecting the 'growth drivers' in the East of England.
- 4.2 Airport traffic forms a dominant part of traffic on the adjacent section of the A120: up to half of all traffic. It accounts for a quarter of all traffic on the M11 south of Junction 8 in the peak direction. On other main roads in the catchment area it accounts for around one tenth of all traffic.
- 4.3 There is already serious pressure and some congestion on the M11 southbound, parts of the A120, and some local minor roads. The forecast traffic growth will exacerbate this. Traffic growth above the BAA forecasts would substantially worsen conditions.
- 4.4 Traffic with the enhanced (public transport) scenario differs by about 5% from the basic 35mppa forecast: barely a year's growth in general traffic. In addition, it is not clear why BAA has not adopted an enhanced public transport strategy for the 25mppa case.
- 4.5 London-bound rail travel by air passengers is forecast to increase by one-third for 25mppa and by two-thirds for 35mppa. BAA's 2006 forecasts and FL1148 show significantly higher growth. BAA forecasts in the Network Rail RUS are even higher and DfT figures even higher.
- 4.6 BAA considers that the growth could be accommodated by extending Stansted Express trains to 12 coaches. Even this limited investment would require extension of stations. However, the recent Rail White Paper rules out line capacity increases before 2014,

¹ Technical Note FL1148, Halcrow, 14 Sept 2007.

while the West Anglia line already uses available capacity to its limit. Regional planning proposals will bring greater demand for rail commuting in the corridor, as will regeneration of the lower Lea Valley. Providing adequate capacity to meet all future demands on the congested system, including provision for much higher quality services, requires major investment. Virtually nothing is committed.

- 4.7 Air passenger travel by coach is forecast to double for 35mppa throughput, but this reflects a highly uncertain assumption of London coach fares remaining very low. Commercial decision making, lack of adequate secure funding and rising road congestion poses doubts over a significantly increased coach network. Forecasts for much increased coach and bus travel are therefore very questionable.

5 WIDER ISSUES: TIMESCALES AND IMPACTS

- 5.1 Stansted has developed into a major airport within a very short timescale, its throughput rising rapidly through successive permitted limits. It now has a strong influence on the physical, economic and social structures of the surrounding areas, especially through its impact on transport, both highways and rail. Stansted Express services dominate West Anglia rail capacity and constrain the scope for providing other services.
- 5.2 BAA's forecasts for surface access demand point to continuing significant growth, so that airport traffic will dominate key transport corridors even more. If permission is granted for removal of the 25mppa limit, growth in airport transport will have serious impact on key roads and rail services. The resultant damage to transport quality as well as capacity will harm regional plans for growth in population and activities.
- 5.3 The forecasts prepared by BAA underestimate the growth in surface travel, for three main reasons. First, they are mostly limited to the year 2014 and do not seek to illustrate demand trends for further years; even though population and employment, and hence travel demand, will continue to grow. Second, they assume a higher level of air transfer passengers than for today or at 25mppa, so generating a lower surface access demand. Third, they adopt a set figure of 35mppa; yet one runway could handle 45mppa or higher. For these reasons, the BAA forecasts of surface access demand are partial and misleading.